STATE OF TEXAS COUNTY OF TARRANT CITY OF GRAPEVINE

The Historic Preservation Commission for the City of Grapevine, Texas met in Public Hearing on Wednesday, September 25, 2019, at 6:00 p.m. in the Grapevine City Hall, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Council Chambers, 200 South Main Street, Grapevine, Texas with the following members present to wit:

Sean Shope

Chairman

Vick Cox

Vice-Chairman

Ashley Anderson Eric Gilliland Commissioner Commissioner

Chuck Voelker

Commissioner

Paula Wilbanks

Alternate

Paul Slechta

City Council Liaison

Monica Hotelling

P & Z Liaison

The above commissioners constituted a quorum with Commissioner(s) Jason Parker and Margaret Telford absent.

With the following city staff present:

Paula Newman

Managing Director of Administration & Operations,

Grapevine Convention & Visitors Bureau (CVB)

Matthew Boyle

Assistant City of Grapevine Attorney

David Klempin

Historic Preservation Officer (HPO)

Mary Bush

Historic Preservation Secretary

### **CALL TO ORDER**

Chairman Shope welcomed all and thanked all for their attendance and support.

#### CITIZEN COMMENTS

Any person who is not scheduled on the agenda may address the Historic Preservation Commission under Citizen Comments by completing a Citizen Appearance Request form. In accordance with the Texas Open Meetings Act, the Commission is restricted in discussing or taking action during Citizen Comments.

No comments were made.

## **WORK SESSION**

# Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness as follows:

A. Approved Certificates of Appropriateness as follows:

```
#CA19-42 for property located at 808 East Wall Street:
#CA19-68 for property located at 846 East Wall Street;
#CA19-69 for property located at 600 West College Street:
#CA19-71 for property located at 221 West College Street;
#CA19-72 for property located at 530 South Main Street:
#CA19-73 for property located at 214 East College Street;
#CA19-74 for property located at 612 East Wall Street;
#CA19-75 for property located at 603 East Worth Street:
#CA19-77 for property located at 417 South Main Street:
#CA19-79 for property located at 807 East Worth Street;
#CA19-80 for property located at 403 East Worth Street:
#CA19-81 for property located at 324 South Main Street;
#CA19-82 for property located at 426 East Texas Street:
#CA19-83 for property located at 901 West Sunset Street;
#CA19-84 for property located at 318 Ruth Street;
#CA19-85 for property located at 129 South Main Street, Suite #140;
#CA19-87 for property located at 325 East Worth Street:
#CA19-88 for property located at 322 East.
```

## **PUBLIC HEARING**

Chairman Shope declared the **Public Hearing for #HL19-02** open for the property located at 212 East Texas Street, legally described as Abstract 422 Tract 60B, William Dooley Survey, Grapevine, City of, Texas to the Grapevine Historic Preservation Ordinance 91-73 (Appendix G – Grapevine Code of Ordinances), as amended for the following items:

Chairman Shope called on David Klempin to present the case.

## BACKGROUND:

On August 28, 2019, applicant Jennifer Hibbs, Assistant City Manager of the City of Grapevine, submitted an application for Historic Landmark Overlay #HL19-02, for property located at 212 East Texas Street, City of Grapevine. The property contains a vacant house and is currently owned by the City. The property was recently platted as Lot 1, Block 36, City of Grapevine and will be sold through the City's sealed bid sale process as a single family home.

The property was owned by Grapevine harness maker J. H. Withrow who with his wife lived there from 1923 through the 1940s. Later owner C. V. Tidwell built the current house in 1946. It is a minimal traditional style gabled house with three bedrooms and

one and one half baths. A carport was added to the rear of the house later. The house is asymmetrical in plan with a small recessed front porch.

## **RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommended the Historic Preservation Commission <u>approve</u> the proposed Historic Landmark Subdistrict overlay to the Grapevine Historic Preservation Ordinance 91-73 (Appendix G – Grapevine Code of Ordinances), as amended for following property addressed as:

212 East Texas Street, legally described as Abstract 422, Tract 60B, William Dooley Survey, City of Grapevine.

Staff recommended approval of the Historic Overlay #HL19-02 to record the history of the property and to allow the Historic Preservation Commission to have input in the future development of the property. A set of the proposed Design Guidelines for the property were presented

Chuck Voelker moved to close the Public Hearing for #HL19-02; Vick Cox seconded the motion prevailing in a vote of:

Ayes: 6 (Shope, Cox, Anderson, Gilliland, Voelker and Wilbanks)

Absent: 2 (Parker and Telford)

Nays: 0

Chuck Voelker made the motion to approve with conditions as presented #HL19-02; Vick Cox seconded the motion prevailing in a vote of:

Ayes: 6 (Shope, Cox, Anderson, Gilliland, Voelker and Wilbanks)

Absent: 2 (Parker and Telford)

Nays: 0

.....

#### **PUBLIC HEARING**

Chairman Shope declared the **Public Hearing for #CA19-89** open for the property located at 835 East Texas Street, legally described as Block 2 Lot 12 & East ½ of 13, D.E. Box Addition, Grapevine, Texas to the Grapevine Historic Preservation Ordinance 91-73 (Appendix G – Grapevine Code of Ordinances), as amended for the following items:

Chairman Shope called on David Klempin to present the case.

## **BACKGROUND:**

Certificate of Appropriateness application #CA19-89 was submitted on May 8, 2019 by the applicant. The original house was constructed in 1950 for Denzil and Mary Stone

Myers as their family home. The staff review of the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Structures Ten Criteria (attached) with regard to this property found the work to be in compliance with the Secretary of Interior Standards.

Plans for the new additions were developed by Scott Buchanan of Buchanan Design following the 2013-23 Historic Preservation Ordinance and Design Guidelines for the D. E. Box Addition Historic District.

The total living area including the original 1,084 square foot house and the new addition of 901 square feet is 3,274 square feet. The existing covered front porch of 34 square feet; covered rear patio of 333 square feet, the original side porch of 97 square feet; the side porch of 35 square feet and the Porte Cochere of 600 square feet are not included in the maximum square feet (as per the Preservation Ordinance). The new detached garage with workshop is 826 square feet. The property lot size is 22,317 square feet and the proposed building coverage is 23 percent, (maximum 40 percent lot coverage). The impervious percentage for the site is 38 per cent. Building height is 15'-4".

# **RECOMMENDATION:**

- 1. To remove the existing two car attached garage and rear exterior wall as indicated in the demolition plan;
- 2. To construct a new one-story addition to the west and rear of the house; and
- 3. To construct a new 826 square foot two-car detached garage with workshop;

as per attached plans with the condition a variance be granted for the 826 square foot two-car garage to combine the Ordinance allowed 500 square footage of the two car garage; with the 200 square footage of the accessory storage building; and 126 square feet from the living area of the house; a building permit is obtained from the Building Department; and all exterior materials, finishes, paint colors, doors and hardware, windows and exterior light fixtures are required to be approved on a separate Certificate(s) of Appropriateness.

Staff recommended the Historic Preservation Commission approve with conditions #CA19-89 to remove the existing two-car attached garage and rear exterior wall as per the demolition plan; construct a new one-story addition to the west side and rear of the house; construct new two car detached garage with workshop as per attached plans with the condition a variance be granted to combine the two-car garage with accessory storage square footage; a building permit is obtained from the Building Department; and all exterior materials, finishes, paint colors, doors and hardware, windows and exterior light fixtures are required to be approved on a separate Certificate(s) of Appropriateness.

Chairman Shope called on the property owners to come forward with their comments.

Property owners Ronnie and Michelle Park came forward with Michelle saying she was excited as a granddaughter of Mary Stone Myers had reached out to her through

Facebook. They said they have lived in Coppell since 1995 and have been looking in Grapevine for the last three years and happy to now have the property Neal Cooper had purchased for another client four years ago. Neal Cooper said Michelle and Ronnie had been great to work with, as the plans showed the front elevation would remain very near the same as all of the front would be preserved, the roof pitch would remain original and the Porte Cochere would add purpose to the west side as extremely linear-but also functional. He said the two-car garage made more sense to fill-out the elevation as the lot is over one-half acre. Mr. Park said as a builder he needed the workshop; and the windows would be replaced with new wood windows; they are now looking for photos of the house when first built to replicate the original look.

Chairman Shope confirmed the setback was three (3) feet. Vice-Chair Cox asked about the two front entries as original, Mr. Cooper said yes the sidewalk leads to the main front entry but the second front entry would also be used. Commissioner Paula Wilbanks inquired about the two large trees near the front door plus the one to the west nearer the neighbor, Mr. Park said they would absolutely be keeping the beautiful trees; Mr. Cooper said the Elm tree was near the end of life for its species.

Vick Cox moved to close the Public Hearing for #CA19-89; Chuck Voelker seconded the motion prevailing in a vote of:

Ayes: 6 (Shope, Cox, Anderson, Gilliland, Voelker and Wilbanks)

Absent: 2 (Parker and Telford)

Nays: 0

Chairman Shope called for discussion. Commissioner Voelker asked how much of a house can be rolled into a garage; this is an added 126 square feet, how much, what is the limit? Chairman Shope said this had been looked at case by case, and this is a large lot; Commissioner Voelker said this is deviating from the Design Guidelines. Vice Chairman Vick Cox concurred with Commissioner Voelker saying in the future it should be decided what is the limit.

Vick Cox made the motion to approve with conditions as presented #CA19-89; Eric Gilliland seconded the motion prevailing in a vote of:

Ayes: 5 (Shope, Cox, Anderson, Gilliland and Wilbanks)

Absent: 2 (Parker and Telford)

Nays: 1 (Voelker)

#### PUBLIC HEARING

Chairman Shope declared the **Public Hearing for #CA19-93** open for the property located at 238 Austin Street, legally described as Block 104 Lot 7-8 S ½ lot 7-8, College Heights Addition, Grapevine, Texas to the Grapevine Historic Preservation Ordinance

91-73 (Appendix G – Grapevine Code of Ordinances), as amended for the following items:

Chairman Shope called on David Klempin to present the case.

## **BACKGROUND:**

Certificate of Appropriateness application #CA19-93 was submitted on August 28, 2019 by the applicant, John Finn to construct a new addition to the second floor above the existing kitchen and bedroom. The original house was constructed in 2005 for the Eboumwin family following the Design Guidelines established for the property.

Plans for the new second floor addition were designed by L120 Engineering and Design following the 2013-23 Preservation Ordinance and Design Guidelines. The proposed addition would be located above the existing kitchen and bedroom and would include a new master bedroom with bath and closets. The new addition was designed to fit within the side-yard setback plane.

The total living area including the original 1,810 square foot house and the new proposed addition of 500 square feet is 2,310 square feet, within the 3,400 square foot maximum allowed by the Preservation Ordinance. The existing covered front porch is not included in the maximum square feet (as per the Preservation Ordinance). The existing one-car garage is 250 square feet. The property lot size is 8,412 square feet and the proposed building coverage is 15 percent, (maximum 40 percent lot coverage). The building height is 29'-6".

### **RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommended the Historic Preservation Commission <u>approve with conditions</u> Certificate of Appropriateness #CA19-93 for the property located at 238 Austin Street, legally described as Block 104, Lot 7 & 8 South 1/2, College Heights Addition, City of Grapevine, to the Grapevine Historic Preservation Ordinance 91-73 (Appendix G – Grapevine Code of Ordinances), as amended for the following items:

- 1. To remove roof of rear wing of house and construct a new 500 square foot second floor addition to include a new master bedroom, bath and closet areas:
- 2. To remove the improperly installed wood siding; apply a house-wrap and reinstall the original siding; and
- 3. To remove asphalt shingles from front porch roof and install metal roofing;

as per the attached plans with the condition a building permit is obtained from the Building Department; and all exterior materials, finishes, paint colors, doors and hardware, windows and exterior light fixtures are required to be approved on a separate Certificate(s) of Appropriateness.

Staff review of the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Structures Ten Criteria with regard to this property found the work to be in compliance

with the Secretary of Interior Standards.

Staff recommended the Historic Preservation Commission approve #CA19-93 to construct the new addition to the second floor, remove and re-install original wood siding and install a new metal roof over the existing porch with the conditions a building permit is obtained from the Building Department; and all exterior materials, finishes, paint colors, doors and hardware, windows and exterior light fixtures are required to be approved on a separate Certificate(s) of Appropriateness.

Chairman Shope called on the applicant to come forward to speak.

Property owner John Finn came forward to tell the Commission he and his fiancé had moved here from Waco and they were excited to be in Grapevine.

Commissioner Cox asked the history of the land, if East Texas Street had been previously known as Washam Avenue; Mr. Klempin said yes, it was known as Washam Avenue at the time of the 1907 plat as shown in the agenda packet.

Chairman Shope asked for any other questions or comments, there were none.

Vick Cox moved to close the Public Hearing for #CA19-93; Chuck Voelker seconded the motion prevailing in a vote of:

Ayes: 6 (Shope, Cox, Anderson, Gilliland, Voelker and Wilbanks

Absent: 2 (Parker and Telford)

Nays: 0

Ashley Anderson made the motion to approve with conditions as presented #CA19-93; Eric Gilliland seconded the motion prevailing in a vote of:

Ayes: 6 (Shope, Cox, Anderson, Gilliland, Voelker and Wilbanks)

Absent: 2 (Parker and Telford)

Nays: 0

....

MINUTES

Chuck Voelker made the motion to approve the minutes of the July 24, 2019 meeting as written; Paula Wilbanks seconded the motion which prevailed in the following vote:

Ayes: 6 (Shope, Cox, Anderson, Gilliland, Voelker and Wilbanks)

Absent: 2 (Parker and Telford)

Nays: 0

.......

### **ADJOURNMENT**

Vick Cox made the motion to adjourn the meeting; Chuck Voelker seconded the motion, which prevailed in the following vote:

Ayes: 6 (Shope, Cox, Anderson, Gilliland, Voelker and Wilbanks)

Absent: 2 (Parker and Telford)

Nays: 0

The meeting adjourned at 6:49 p.m.

Meetings may be viewed at: <a href="http://www.grapevinetexas.gov/1059/Meeting-Videos">http://www.grapevinetexas.gov/1059/Meeting-Videos</a>

PASSED AND APPROVED BY THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF GRAPEVINE, TEXAS, ON THIS THE 18TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2019.

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

SECRETARY